

A Descriptive Analysis of the Contents and Origins of Research on China Marketing in English

Dan L. Trotter
Shantou University

Wang Lijuan
Liaoning University of Engineering and Technology

This research paper explores the scope and penetration of English-language research into marketing practice on the mainland of the People's Republic of China. In addition to this research itself, the paper also analyzes the researchers who are doing the research, and their affiliations. It was discovered that although China marketing is in its infant stage, research into China marketing is increasing. Further, it was discovered that most China marketing research concerns consumer behavior, and that there is a trend towards quantitative research. The authors conclude that the research is broad in scope, but not extremely deep. Finally, the paper concludes that the demand for China marketing research has outstripped the supply. In addition to these conclusions drawn concerning China marketing research, the following conclusions were drawn concerning China marketing researchers: the top researchers are ethnic Chinese, a majority of the researchers are ethnic Chinese, the top institutions supporting China marketing research are located in Hong Kong, the majority of the top researchers are in Hong Kong, most researchers are not located in Asia but rather in the West, and finally, there has been much Chinese-Western collaboration in the production of China marketing research. One hundred marketing journals and 141 marketing articles were examined.

INTRODUCTION

With the advent of “opening and reform” in the late 1970s under Deng Xiao Ping, China began a startling revolutionary process which today has culminated in the production of a huge market-oriented economy, which has arisen out of the ashes of a previously-moribund Chinese command economy. One of the prerequisites for a market economy is the practice of marketing, and therefore, not surprisingly, China has developed the marketing profession in accordance with the country's development of a market-oriented economy. Everywhere there is print, web, radio, TV, and billboard advertising, as well as the promotional techniques seen everywhere in the West. Corporate executives devise market strategy even as their Western counterparts do. The market mechanism has become an important factor in the economic development of China (Tian

and Wang, 2003; Tian 2008). These changes have come even as China has become a major player in the global economy. These changes, these revolutionary changes, have not only impacted Chinese consumers, but they have impacted the entire international economy (Wu, 2009).

Along with the fact that the market-oriented economic system has become the dominant economic force in China, marketing has become one of the hottest subjects discussed in Chinese society, and marketing research has become one of the most rewarding fields for academic study. However, given the fact that the market economic system is relatively new in China, marketing itself as a field of study is still in its initial development stage, and academic marketing research papers, compared with marketing research in Western countries, is not only limited in scope but also in numbers. While researchers have investigated management activities in China, they have not investigated business marketing to the same degree. Although the number of research articles on China marketing has increased in the last 25 years, there is still no generally-accepted theoretical framework in which China marketing can be placed. (Wang & Song, 2011) In addition, due to language constraints much of China marketing research work has not been published in English journals. Current marketing research pertaining to China does not reflect the reality of the Chinese economy, nor does it meet the needs of the business world.

Philip Kotler, often called “the father of modern marketing,” has written that “China’s rapid development of the American-style consumer culture, which is revolutionizing the lives of hundreds of millions of Chinese, will have the potential to reshape the world... As China goes, so goes the world.” (Kotler, P., 2010) This revolutionary development of a consumer market in China has in turn provided opportunities for marketing scholars, whose services should be in demand to help China market their products and services. This article aims to explore the development of marketing research pertaining to the China market by taking an inventory of relevant marketing journals beginning in 1988, when the earliest marketing research papers pertaining to China were posted online.

METHODOLOGY

A two-stage design was employed. The first stage was designed to reach back to the approximate time in the past when research into modern Chinese marketing began. The relatively long time period required that a relatively small (seven) number of journals be searched. The second stage was designed to be broader than the first, and therefore, 93 journals were chosen, but were only searched for relevant articles published in the first half of 2012. The broader range of searched articles required a shorter chronological scope.

The First Stage

A list of all marketing journals known to the American Marketing Association was obtained (AMA, 2010). A search was made of this list for all journals whose titles were linked to marketing in China. There were no such journals. However, the authors were aware of a new journal directly related to marketing in China, whose name is *International Journal of China Marketing (IJCM)*, and therefore this journal was chosen. Next, a search was made of the American Marketing Association’s comprehensive list for all journals whose titles were associated with marketing in Asia generally, as opposed to marketing in China specifically. The following three journals in that category were identified: *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and*

Logistics (APJML), *Asian Journal of Marketing (AJM)*, and *Australasian Marketing Journal (AMJ)*.

In order to find a meaningful sample of journal articles, it was decided to make an online search of these four journals for articles related to China marketing. Eleven articles were found in *IJCM*, 39 articles were found in *APJML*, 2 articles were discovered in *AJM*, and 5 articles were found in *AMJ*, for a total of 57 articles. Since the authors were not satisfied with a sample number of 57 articles from those four journals, they added three additional journals from the American Marketing Association's comprehensive list that related to *international* or *global* marketing. These three journals were the *Journal of Global Marketing (JGM)*, the *Journal of International Marketing (JIM)*, and the *Journal of International Consumer Marketing (JICM)*. Nineteen articles were found in *JGM*, 5 articles were found in *JIM*, and 19 articles were found in *JICM*, for a total of 43, bringing the total research sample to 100 articles.

Except for the *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, the entire table of contents for each journal was searched, starting from the date that the journal articles were posted online, up until the most current issue as of September 20, 2011. The *Journal of International Consumer Marketing's* table of contents was only searched partially, starting with the most recent issues, because it was felt that earlier issues tended to be more general, theoretical and conceptual, rather than quantitative and practical, as the more recent issues were. The beginning search dates (which were the earliest online publication dates) for journals are listed as follows: *AJM* (2007), *AMJ* (June, 1998), *APJML* (1989), *IJCM* (November, 2010), *JGM* (1988), and *JIM* (March, 2005), *JICM* (2006).

The abstracts of the one-hundred articles were searched for the following data: authors, authors' affiliations, number of pages of each article, key words, country of the journal's origin, date of publication, and whether the research method used was qualitative or quantitative. In addition, an effort was made to categorize each article. After all the abstracts were categorized, a list of sixteen categories had been produced. These categories were narrowed down to five broader categories: 1) advertising, 2) consumer behavior, 3) marketing strategy, 4) theoretical issues, and 5) miscellaneous.

In general, we have (partially) followed the procedure of an earlier survey of journal articles relating to marketing in China by Ouyang, Zhou, and Zhou (2000). In that research, the authors summarized the work that had been published, the topics covered in the work, and the places the papers have been published. They then identified the individuals and institutions that had contributed to the creation of that particular body of marketing literature.

The Second Stage

The American Management Association comprehensive list of marketing journals published in English contained 93 English journals. The online tables of content for 2012 (up to July 2012) for those 93 journals were searched, and all article titles apparently dealing with China were further examined. A few of those articles were discarded, because, although they were published in marketing journals, their content was not, strictly speaking, pertinent for marketing. The articles content was categorized by topic, and the authors' and their affiliations were noted. In this manner, 32 relevant articles were obtained.

CONTENTS AND CATEGORIES OF THE ARTICLES – THE FIRST STAGE

Earlier research has detected an upward trend in the number of published articles on China marketing, beginning with opening and reform in the late 1970s. (Ouyang, Zhou, & Zhou, 2000). The results of the research reported in this paper confirm this trend. In stage one of the research, the period from 1988 to 2011 was investigated by examination of 100 relevant articles. Eleven articles were published before 2000; 31 articles were published between 2000 and 2006; and 58 articles were published between 2007 and 2011.

One hundred ninety-five researchers from 70 institutions contributed the 100 articles selected. The earliest article was written in 1988, and the latest article was written in 2011. The average length of the articles (except for the five articles found in *JIM*, whose abstracts did not include page numbers) was 14.5 pages. There were several types of papers, including concept papers, literature reviews, case studies, qualitative studies, and studies using typical quantitative methods. There were seven journals searched. The journals are ranked in Table 1 below by the number of articles within them that were related to China marketing.

The Content of the Articles

The majority of the articles (65%) did not focus on any one particular industry. However, those articles (35%) which did examine a particular industry studied a wide variety of Chinese industries, including food retailing, automobiles, books, computers, credit cards, higher education, IT (including e-commerce, internet services, and telecommunications), iron and steel, manufacturing, restaurants, sports, retailing (including hypermarkets and malls), tourism, VCDs, TVs, and clothing.

The articles were distributed across five categories: 1) advertising and promotion 2) consumer behavior, 3) marketing strategy, 4) theoretical issues, and 5) miscellaneous. A verbal description of the content of the articles in each category is given below, followed by a table that will summarize the content of the one hundred articles examined (see Table 2 for categories and sub-categories).

Advertising & Promotion

Eighteen (18%) of the 100 papers in the research sample were related to advertising and promotion. Articles related to advertising or promotion in China appeared in all seven of the journals chosen for this research. Examples of subjects covered in the advertising and promotion category are the *influence of culture* (La Ferle, Edwards & Li, 2008; Emery & Tian, 2010; La Ferle & Lee, 2003) the *influence of English* (Hung & Heeler, 1999) on Chinese advertising, *governmental regulation* of Chinese advertising (Gao, 2007; Gao & Zhang, 2011), and the use of *sex appeal* in Chinese advertising (Cui & Yang, 2009).

Consumer Behavior

Thirty-nine (39%) of the papers in the research sample dealt with consumer behavior. Articles related to consumer behavior in China appeared in all seven of the journals chosen for this research. Consumer behavior was the most researched topic in the sample journals. Representative subjects investigated in the articles written about consumer behavior in China include the following: *Chinese values* (Wang, Chen, Chan, & Zheng, 2000; Cheung & Prendergast, 2006; Sun & Wang, 2007; Tai, 2008, Smith, et al., 2010), *Chinese attitudes* (Cui, Chan, & Joy, 2008; Li, Mizerski, Lee, & Liu, 2009; Sun & Wang, 2010) *country of origin effects*

(Kwok, Uncles, & Huang, 2006; Oh & Zhang, 2010; Parker, Haytco, & Hermans, 2011; Chao & Arnold, 2005; d’Astous & Li, 2009; Ishiia, 2009; Wong, Polonsky, & Garma, 2008) the *influence of children on purchase behavior* (MacNeal & Yeh, 1996; MacNeal & Mindy, 1996), *sex appeal* (Liu, Li, & Cheng, 2006; Liu, Shi & Wong, 2010) *perception of brand names* (Ang, 1996; Li, Wang, & Yang; 2011; Yang, Zhou & Chen, 2005), and *perception of store image* (Chang & Luan, 2010; Hua & Jasper, 2010) From this listing we can see that country of origin effects produce a large attraction for researchers. Seven (7%) of the 100 articles surveyed concerned this issue.

TABLE 1
MARKETING JOURNALS – FIRST STAGE

Journal Name		Number	
		Articles	Citations
1. <i>Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics</i>	APJML	39	186
2. <i>Journal of Global Marketing</i>	JGM	19	74
3. <i>Journal of International Consumer Marketing</i>	JICM	19	72
4. <i>International Journal of China Marketing</i>	IJCM	11	1*
5. <i>Journal of International Marketing</i>	JIM	5	50
6. <i>Australasian Marketing Journal</i>	AMJ	5	7
7. <i>Asian Journal of Marketing</i>	AJM	2	0**
Total		100	390

Source for Citations: *Google Scholar*

*The small number of citations may be due to the late date of *IJCM*'s first issue (2010)

**The two articles used in *AJM* were not found in *Google Scholar*

Marketing Strategy

In the research sample there were found 24 articles (24%) which dealt with marketing strategy. Topics investigated include the following: *branding* (Ga, Pan, Tse, & Yim, 2006; Bennet, 2008; Wang, Linyang, & Liu, 2009; Fu, Saunders, & Ou, 2009; Bodet, 2010; Chen, Lam, & Zou, 2011; Chaoying, Jian & Ille, 2011; Leng & Zhang, 2011), *distribution channels* (Wing, 1994; Luk, Li, Ye & Xue; 2003; Yi & Jaffe, 2007; Sternquist & Wang, 2010), *pricing* (Tian, He, Zhao, & Yi, 2005; Liu & Tang, 2005; Zhang & Zhou, 2010; Jiang, Chou, & Tao, 2011), *product positioning* (Skallerud & Grønhaug, 2010), and *service quality* (Prugsamatz & Ofstad, 2006; Gebauer & von Zedtwitz, 2007; Stanworth, 2009). From this it can be seen that branding was the most popular topic for authors writing about marketing strategy in China.

Theoretical Issues

There were 10 articles examined in this study (10%) which have been classified as *theoretical*. This category includes discussions of different modes of marketing in command and transition economies (Wei, 1995; Logan & McEwan, 2010), principles derived from ancient Chinese history applied to modern real estate marketing (Pheng, 2000), marketing for foreign-Chinese joint ventures, a comparison of the business climates of India and China (Panigrahi, Ede, & Calcich, 2002), and theoretical quantitative and methodological issues concerning marketing research in China (Sin & Ho, 2001; Tu, 2011).

Miscellaneous

This final category includes nine articles (9%) found in the research sample that were difficult to categorize, but which nonetheless were of interest. Examples are general articles about marketing in China (Liu, 2007; Thorellia, 1988; Kirpilani & Robinson, 1989; Knowles, Mathur, & Jai-Sheng, 1990), a literature survey of articles written about marketing in China (Ouyang, et al., 2000), the effects of population aging on marketing in China (Hou, 2011) and marketing ethics in China (Walle, 2011; Singh, S. J. V.; Al-Khatib & Clarke, 2007).

TABLE 2
CONTENT OF THE ARTICLES – FIRST STAGE

Category	No. of Articles	Sub-Category*
1. Advertising & Promotion	18	influence of culture governmental regulation sex appeal
2. Consumer Behavior	39	Chinese values Chinese attitudes country of origin effects influence of children on purchase behavior sex appeal perception of brand names perception of store image
3. Marketing Strategy	24	branding distribution channels pricing product positioning service quality
4. Theoretical Issues	10	marketing in command and transition economies ancient Chinese theory and real estate marketing marketing for foreign-Chinese joint ventures comparison of Indian and Chinese business climates marketing research quantitative & methodological issues
5. Miscellaneous	9	general articles about China marketing literature survey about China marketing journal articles effects of population aging on marketing in China marketing ethics in China

*There are no subcategories for the *Theory* and *Miscellaneous* category. Rather, several representative articles are listed.

CONTRIBUTORS AND THEIR AFFILIATIONS – THE FIRST STAGE

Several salient facts emerge from an examination of the 195 researchers who published the one hundred articles employed in stage one. First, it was discovered that of the 195 authors, 111 (57%) of them were ethnic Chinese. This was determined by looking at each author's name, and determining whether the romanization of the name indicated a Chinese name or not. This method

was also used to decide whether or not there had been collaboration between an ethnic Chinese author and a Western one. It was discovered that of the 100 articles, 34 (34%) of them were jointly authored by a Western researcher and an ethnic Chinese one. Only 78 of the 100 papers were jointly authored. Of these 78, 34 (44%) were co-authored by a Westerner and an ethnic Chinese.

Top Contributors

The researchers were ranked using three different methods: *publication credits*, *adjusted publication credits*, and *number of citations*. Table 3 and Table 4 below use *publication credits* in order to rank the authors of the one hundred articles that were examined for this paper. Publication credits have been calculated in two ways: by *total* number of publication credits (cf. Table 3 below), and by *adjusted* number of publication credits (cf. Table 4 below). If a researcher is listed as an author of an article, that researcher was given a publication credit, no matter whether the author was the sole author, or whether there were co-authors. The total number of publication credits obtained in this fashion equals the author's *total* publication credits.

TABLE 3
AUTHOR'S PUBLICATION CREDITS – THE FIRST STAGE

Author	Publication Credits	Institution*
1. Nan Zhou	4	City University of Hong Kong
2. Suk-Ching Ho	3	Chinese University of Hong Kong
3. Geng Cui	3	Lingnan University (Hong Kong)
4. Jianyao Li	3	University of Western Australia
5. Fang Liu	3	University of Western Australia
6. 19 authors published 2 articles	2	
7. 171 authors published 1 article	1	

*Hong Kong universities are in boldface

If the researcher shared the authorship of an article, his *adjusted* publication credits were determined this way: if there was one other co-author, the researcher received one-half of a publication credit. If there were two other co-authors, the researcher received one-third of a publication credit, and so on. This procedure has been adopted in previous studies. (Ouyang, et al., 2000) The 195 researchers who wrote the 100 articles were also ranked by *citations* to their articles by other researchers (Cf. Table 5 below). *Google Scholar* was used in order to find the number of citations to each of the one hundred articles.

It is interesting to note that when the authors are ranked by *total* publication credits, the top five researchers are all Chinese, and that when the authors are ranked by *adjusted* publication credits, the top eight include seven Chinese researchers. This apparently indicates that interest in China marketing has not yet become thoroughly globalized. This is backed by the previously noted fact that 111 (57%) of the 195 authors who contributed to the 100 articles are Chinese.

TABLE 4
AUTHOR'S ADJUSTED PUBLICATION CREDITS – THE FIRST STAGE

Author	Adjusted Publication Credits	Institution*
Susan H.C. Tai	2.00	Hong Kong Polytechnic University
Zhihong Gao	1.50	Rider University (NJ-USA)
Hongbo Tu	1.33	Wuhan Institute of Technology
Suk-Ching Ho	1.33	Chinese University of Hong Kong
Riliang Ou	1.30	Aston Business School (UK)
Nan Zhou	1.25	City University of Hong Kong
Carrie La Ferle	1.20	Southern Methodist Univ/Mich State U
Geng Cui	1.17	Lingnan University (Hong Kong)
187 authors \leq 1.00	\leq 1.00	

*Hong Kong universities are in boldface

As previously mentioned, the researchers were also ranked according to the number of times their articles had been cited by other researchers (cf. Table 5 above). If more than one researcher authored a paper, and the paper was cited once, then each researcher received a citation credit. Thus, no special importance was given to the author whose name was listed first on the paper. An examination of Table 5 in order to discover Chinese names reveals that of the top 41 researchers in terms of citations to their articles, 25 (61%) were Chinese. This is an indication of how Chinese researchers of China marketing seem to be dominating the field.

The Researcher's Institutions

The Affiliations of the Researchers

A look at Table 3 (author's publication credits) and Table 4 (author's adjusted publication credits) will reveal the institutions associated with the researchers who have done the most China marketing research in our sample of articles. It is notable that of the top five researchers as measured by publication credits, three were affiliated with Hong Kong universities, and also, of the top eight researchers as ranked by adjusted publication credits, four were affiliated with Hong Kong Universities. The Hong Kong institutions have been bolded in Table 3 and Table 4 for easy reference. This dominance by Hong Kong institutions continues a trend that was noted in earlier research. (Ouyang, et al., 2000) The dominance of Hong Kong universities can also be seen by an examination of Table 5, which ranks the researchers by citations to their articles. The Hong Kong universities in Table 5 have also been bolded for easy reference, demonstrating that of the top 41 researchers listed in Table 5, 13 (32%) are affiliated with Hong Kong institutions.

The data in Table 5 may also be examined to determine the distribution of universities between Asia and the West. We see that 27 (66%) of the top 41 institutions, as measured by citation credits to their affiliated researchers, are Asian, whereas 14 (34%) of the top 41 institutions are western. It is notable that none of the top 41 institutions are European.

We now turn from examining the 41 institutions listed in Table 5 in order to investigate *all* of the institutions affiliated with the researchers who wrote the one hundred articles of our sample. Table 6 below shows the geographical distribution of the seventy institutions whose researchers produced the one hundred articles. The data there show that a small majority (53%) of

institutions doing China marketing related research are western universities located either in Europe or North America, while a large minority of such institutions are Asian (47%).

TABLE 5
AUTHOR'S CITATION CREDITS – THE FIRST STAGE

Author	Citations	Institution*
1. Allan K.K. Chan	27	Hong Kong Baptist University
2. Cheng_Lu Wang	27	Hong Kong Baptist University
3. Zhen-Xiong Chen	27	Hong Kong Baptist University
4. Zong-Cheng Zheng	27	Zhongshan University (China)
5. Wei Na Li	23	University of Texas
6. Mark J. Arnold	21	St. Louis University
7. Mike C.H. Chao	21	St. Louis University
8. Nan Zhou	21	City University of Hong Kong
9. Leo Yat Ming Sin	19	Chinese University of Hong Kong
10. Mark Uncles	16	University of South Wales
11. Simon Kwok	16	University of South Wales
12. John Fong	15	Macquarie University (Australia)
13. Lauren a. Swanson	15	Chinese University of Hong Kong
14. Suzan Burton	15	Macquarie University (Australia)
15. Carrie La Ferle	14	Michigan State U / Southern Methodist U
16. Swee Hoon Ang	12	National University of Singapore
17. Fang Liu	12	University of Western Australia
18. Amy Wong	11	Lingnan University (Hong Kong)
19. Chui Yim Wong	11	Victoria University (Australia)
20. Irvine Clarke III	11	James Madison University (USA)
21. Jamal Al-Khatib	11	University of St. Thomas
22. Jatinder J. Singh	11	University of Mississippi
23. Lianxi Zhou	11	University of Guelph (Canada)
24. Michael J. Polonsky	11	Deakin University (Australia)
25. Romana Garma	11	Victoria University (Australia)
26. Scott J. Vitell	11	University of Mississippi
27. Jie Chen	10	Purdue University (USA)
28. Lars Ofstad	10	University of Sydney (Australia)
29. Mindy F.J	10	Texas A&M University (USA)
30. Sunita Prugsamatz	10	Griffith University (Australia)
31. Zhilin Yang	10	City University of Hong Kong
32. Kineta Hung	9	University of Hong Kong
33. Stella Yiyang Li	9	University of Hong Kong
34. Steven M. Edwards	9	Southern Methodist University
35. Susan H.C. Tai	9	Hong Kong Polytechnic University
36. Brian Murphy	8	Massey University (New Zealand)
37. Chi Kin (Bennet) Yim	8	University of Hong Kong
38. David K. Tse	8	University of Hong Kong
39. Gerald Yong Ga	8	University of Missouri (USA)
40. Rongmei Wang	8	Massey University (New Zealand)
41. Yigang Pan	8	York University (Canada)
42. 154 authors 0 – 7 cites	0-7	

*Hong Kong universities are in boldface

TABLE 6
GEOGRAPHICAL DISTRIBUTION OF AUTHORS' INSTITUTIONS – STAGE ONE

	Hong Kong	PRC	Asian(HK and PRC excluded)	Europe	North American	All Institutions
No. Institutions	7	14	12	7	30	70
Percentage	10%	20%	17%	10%	43%	100%

TABLE 7
NUMBER OF CHINA-RELATED ARTICLES PUBLISHED IN 2012 – STAGE TWO

Journal Name	No.
1. <i>Public Relations Review</i>	6
2. <i>Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics</i>	4
3. <i>The International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research</i>	3
4. <i>International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management</i>	2
5. <i>Journal of Brand Management</i>	2
6. <i>Journal of Consumer Marketing</i>	2
7. <i>Journal of International Consumer Marketing</i>	2
8. <i>Market Intelligence and Planning</i>	2
9. <i>International Journal of Wine Business Research</i>	1
10. <i>Journal of Consumer Behavior</i>	1
11. <i>Journal of Financial Services Marketing</i>	1
12. <i>Journal of Medical Marketing</i>	1
13. <i>Journal of Product & Brand Management</i>	1
14. <i>Journal of Research in Interactive Marketing</i>	1
15. <i>Journal of Strategic Marketing</i>	1
16. <i>Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing</i>	1
17. <i>Young Consumers</i>	1
TOTAL	32

All of the other journals in stage two were not used in stage one. It is reasonable to assume that had the other journals listed in Table 7 been searched back to the date that they first appeared online, that more China marketing articles might have been found. Four of the authors with publication credits in stage one appeared with publication credits in stage two. These four authors' universities were in Asia, North America, Hong Kong, and mainland China. They are Lisa McNeil of the University of Otago (New Zealand), Zhi Honggao of Rider University (USA), Zhilin Yang of the City University of Hong Kong, and Ting Juichuo of Renmin University (mainland China).

TABLE 8
CONTENT OF THE ARTICLES PUBLISHED IN 2012 – STAGE TWO

Category	Number of Articles	Representative Topics*
1. Consumer Behavior	12	Attitudes towards viral mobile marketing, intention, and behavior Wine consumption Values, intention and mall shopping behavior Chinese consumers collectivists or individualists? State-owned versus privately-owned banks Service quality Brand image and brand preference Crisis brand-management Organic food purchase intentions Coupon value for new products Young luxury consumers
2. Cultural Effects	5	Store type Country of origin effects Chinese consumer ethnocentrism Reflection of cultural values on social network sites Effect of Chinese culture on public relations U.S. – China differences in re puffery
3. Public Relations	4	Chinese government and public relations Public relations as a news source Professional standards of public relations
4. Advertising & Promotion	3	Promotion in the supermarket industry Puffery Website promotion of upscale hotels
5. Marketing Strategy	2	Sales strategy for shampoo New product performance and corporate culture New product performance and strategic orientation
6. Theory*	2	Overhyping in the hospitality industry Statistical validity of personality scales used in China
7. Miscellaneous*	4	Managing strategic business relationships Chinese health care system National image branding Service quality in the language training market
TOTAL	32	

*There is no one-to-one correspondence between articles and topics.

TABLE 9
GEOGRAPHICAL DISTRIBUTION OF AUTHORS' INSTITUTIONS – STAGE TWO

	Hong Kong	PRC	Asian (Excluding PRC & Hong Kong)	Europe	North American	All Institutions
No. Institutions	2	7	8	7	17	41
Percentage	5%	17%	19.5%	17%	41.5%	100%
STAGE ONE RESULTS =>	7	14	12	7	30	70
	10%	20%	17%	10%	43%	100%

TABLE 10
TITLES OF ARTICLES PUBLISHED IN 2012- SECOND STAGE

1	A relational perspective on media relations strategies: The Chinese government's news conferences from 2001 to 2009
2	A strategic investigation of the determinants of wine consumption in China
3	An institutional perspective of public relations practices in the Chinese cultural contexts
4	Assessing the fit of two brand personality scales in a Chinese context and revisiting the predictive validity of two methods of measuring self-congruity
5	Beyond state-owned banks: Evidence from Shanghai bank customers
6	Branding national images: The 2008 Beijing Summer Olympics, 2010 Shanghai World Expo, and 2010 Guangzhou Asian Games
7	Chinese consumer ethnocentrism: A field experiment
8	Clan culture, strategic orientation and new product performance in Chinese marketing ventures: an exploration of main and moderating effects
9	Crisis brand management in emerging markets: Insight from the Chinese infant milk powder scandal
10	Cultural values reflected in corporate pages on popular social network sites in China and the United States
11	Dispelling the collective myth of Chinese consumers: a new generation of brand-conscious individualists
12	How public relations functions as news sources in China
13	Impacts of store type importance and country of origin: Exploring the case of dietary supplements in the Chinese market
14	Institutionalizing public relations in China: A sociological analysis of the Chinese Premier's Press Conference
15	Is this Shangri-La? The case for authenticity in the Chinese and Indian hospitality industry
16	Linking Perceived Service Quality to Relational Outcomes in a Chinese Context
17	Managing strategic business relationships in retail operations: evidence from China
18	Organic food products in China: determinants of consumers' purchase intentions
19	Perceived professional standards and roles of public relations in China: Through the lens of Chinese public relations practitioners
20	Perception of puffery in advertising: investigating the China-US differences

21	Personal values and mall shopping behaviour: The mediating role of intention among Chinese consumers
22	Predicting Young American and Chinese Consumers' Mobile Viral Attitudes, Intents, and Behavior
23	Predicting young Chinese consumers' mobile viral attitudes, intents and behavior
24	Sales promotion in the supermarket industry: a four-country case comparison
25	Service quality in the language training market in China
26	The Chinese health care system: An analysis of the current and emerging health care needs
27	The framing effect of coupon value for new products: an empirical study in China
28	The impact of lifestyle and ethnocentrism on consumers' purchase intentions of fresh fruit in China
29	The role of brand image congruity in Chinese consumers' brand preference
30	The Young Luxury Consumers in China
31	What Does Hotel Website Content Say About a Property—An Evaluation of Upscale Hotels in Taiwan and China
32	What Makes Sales in Chinese Shampoo Industry? A DEA study based on Efficient Market Hypothesis

Table 8 displays the content categories into which the articles were divided. We see that five of the categories used in stage two are the same with the categories in stage one, namely: consumer behavior, advertising and promotion, marketing strategy, theoretical and miscellaneous. Two additional categories were used in stage two; namely public relations and cultural effects.

Table 9 exhibits a comparison of the geographical distribution of the authors discovered in stage one with the geographical distribution of the authors found in stage two. The reader should first notice how similar the distribution is. In both stages, European and North American institutions outnumbered Asian institutions, including those in Hong Kong and in mainland China. In both stages, institutions on the mainland outnumbered those in Hong Kong; however, it should be remembered that there are fewer institutions in Hong Kong than there are on the mainland, and that often, authors from one Hong Kong institution will publish many articles. Table 9 does not reflect that statistical reality. One difference between the two stages is that the percentage of institutions located in Hong Kong in stage two was half that of stage one. It should be noted that four authors who were working for business firms, and who were not affiliated with a university when they published the article, were excluded from the statistics in Table 9.

Finally, Table 10 lists the titles of all articles used in stage two, in order to give the reader an opportunity to gain an appreciation of the content area of the most recent China marketing research in English.

INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF CHINA MARKETING

One of the journals used in this study was the *International Journal of China Marketing*. A special section of this paper will be devoted to this journal, because, as far as is known by the authors, this is the first academic journal in print devoted entirely to marketing in China. The journal was established in the United States in 2010, and was introduced by the renowned marketing scholar Philip Kotler, who has earned the sobriquet “the father of marketing.” In the introduction to the inaugural issue, Dr. Kotler suggested that the journal could examine “almost all aspects” of marketing in China. (Kotler, 2010) Indeed, the scope of IJCM’s publications

matches that of the articles found in the other journals used in this research. Below, we will use the same categories which were used to analyze the other journals in stage one of the research. We will sort the relevant articles found in *IJCM* into the following categories: *advertising and promotion, consumer behavior, marketing strategy, theoretical*.

In commentary provided to introduce the third issue, Geoffrey P. Lantos proclaimed “The notion of a market oriented economy is still brand new in China, while marketing as a field of scholastic study is just in its beginning steps... I feel it is an honor to write this commentary on behalf of the editorial board. Like Dr. Philip Kotler and Dr. Ping Zhao, I sincerely hope the *International Journal of China Marketing* will continue to deliver the highest quality research in the service of those who wish to understand the world of Chinese marketing better.” (Lantos, 2011)

It is the authors’ considered opinion that *IJCM* has indeed begun to deliver the highest quality research into the world of China marketing. The overview below will give the reader a taste of the research done so far in the first four issues published to date. It should be noted that the articles in the first two issues were included in the sample of 100 articles studied in stage one of this research. The articles in the third and fourth issue were not included in the research samples of this paper, but will be discussed in this special section.

Advertising and Promotion

In the first three issues, *IJCM* has published two articles related to advertising and promotion in China. The first article (Emery & Tian, 2010) updated Hofstede’s (1980) famous model of cultural variables, related Pollay’s (1983) advertising appeals to those variables, and hypothesized that the advertising appeals which appealed to either China’s or the United States’ salient cultural variables would have the most impact. For example, China is considered very masculine. An advertising appeal of *effective* would be considered a masculine appeal. Thus, it was hypothesized that an advertisement with an *effective* appeal should perform better in China than in the United States. Of twenty such hypotheses, only nine were supported, and one was significant in the opposite direction. The authors therefore concluded that it would be unwise to use Hofstede’s cultural dimensions as a sole predictor for advertising effectiveness in China. The researchers speculated that for practical use Hofstede’s dimensions were either outdated, or too broad, or both. In addition, the authors speculated that the effectiveness of advertising appeals may be moderated by other factors such as age, societal trends, the political-legal environment and product usage.

The second article in *IJCM* concerning advertising measured changes in brand attitude based upon advertising appeals which mixed rational and emotional appeals. (Chaoying, Jian, & Ille, 2011) It was hypothesized that customers who predominately processed information cognitively would respond more positively to *rational* appeals in a mixed-appeal advertisement, and customers who predominately processed information intuitively would more positively respond to *emotional* appeals in a mixed-appeal advertisement. The authors, having studied an advertisement for a Chinese telecommunication service, concluded that mixing rational and emotional appeals did not hinder effectiveness when those appeals were delivered to a general audience, and that a mixing strategy is a good compromise when trying to attract a population of people who process both emotionally and rationally.

The fourth issue of *IJCM* contained an article concerning advertising and promotion in virtual worlds, which are computer generated. (Sharma, Li & Wang, 2012) The most well-known of these virtual worlds is Second Life. Real life companies such as IBM advertise their products

in the virtual world of Second Life, or they have conferences discussing their products. The authors discovered that E-marketing in Second Life exactly mirrors marketing in the real world, with manufacturing, distribution, sales, etc. One implication for business reported by the authors is that marketing in the virtual world of Second Life can have positive effects for the marketing efforts of the company in the real world.

Consumer Behavior

There were three articles dealing with consumer behavior in the first three issues of *IJCM*. The first was a case study of an ethnic Chinese restaurant located in the United States (Tian & Wang, 2010). The authors concluded that reliability and value were the primary indicators of satisfaction for foreign customers of ethnic restaurants. The authors failed to corroborate previous research, which suggested that customers' cultural awareness of the ethnic food sold, had positive effects on customer satisfaction. The second article (Li, Tu, & Li, 2011) investigated the attitudes of Chinese peasants towards refrigerator purchases, and ranked the relative importance to these peasants of seven attributes of refrigerators. The refrigerators' brand was discovered to be of the most importance, followed by price, color, structure, power consumption, volume, and cooling capacity. The author concluded that peasant consumer attitudes towards refrigerator attributes varied in different regions and markets, and that therefore market segmentation was very important. The third article dealing with consumer behavior studied the different attractions to consumers for Chinese supermarkets and Chinese wet markets, the supermarkets being superior in safety and quality, the wet markets being superior in price, convenience, and freshness. (Cui, 2011)

The fourth issue of *IJCM* contained two articles dealing with consumer behavior. The first dealt with the acceptance of (and resistance to) mobile marketing among young Chinese consumers. This article reported that acceptance of mobile marketing was directly correlated with young mobile phone users' propensity to share content, directly related to users' propensity to access content, and directly related to the users' personal attachment to their phone. Based on these findings, the author suggested that marketers emphasize meaningful incentives and value propositions to encourage consumers to provide information, which would then make them more susceptible to mobile marketing.

The second article in the fourth issue dealing with consumer behavior dealt with face consciousness of Chinese consumers, and its effect on decision-making styles of young Chinese adult consumers (Xue & Wang, 2012). The authors discovered that there was a significantly positive relationship between five face consciousness characteristics and a Chinese consumer with a perfectionistic, high-quality consciousness, for example. Other consumer decision-making styles that were positively correlated with face consciousness were a novelty-fashion conscious consumer, recreational consumers, and hedonistic consumers.

Marketing Strategy

Articles in *IJCM* dealing with marketing strategy included research into pricing, product positioning and product development, branding, and service quality. One article examined the propensity for Chinese companies to start price wars (Zhang & Zhou, 2010). The authors conclude that, contrary to much opinion, Chinese businesses are not irrational to fight such wars, but that the rational desire to achieve economies of scales is the motivation behind these wars, and that many Chinese businesses participating in them emerge stronger and more profitable. A second article (Calantone, Benedetto, & Song, 2011) develops a model whose constructs predict

the success of new product launches, and then tests the model using samples from the United States and China. The authors conclude that new product launches in both countries are (generally) governed by the same factors, which are: launch timing, launch execution tactics, resource allocation, marketing activities, distribution channel support, market orientation, and cross-functional integration on launch. A third article describes “Shanzhai” products and branding (Leng & Zhang, 2011), which explains the highly successful marketing strategy employed by small Chinese companies when they imitate the products of large successful brands (and sometimes infringe on the copyright of the more established product’s brand name). A fourth article (Shen & Wang, 2011) investigates public satisfaction with education in Beijing, in the context of Chinese education reform.

The fourth issue of *IJCM* contained one article dealing with marketing strategy. This was an article describing a Japanese overseas retailer doing business in Guangzhou (Wang, 2012). This anthropological study examined localization practices of the Japanese firm. One such localization practice was intensive hiring of Chinese, which contrasted with the typical ethnocentric hiring practice of Japanese firms. The other localization practice employed by the Japanese firm was the adoption of a consignment form of contract between the company and suppliers. Suppliers supplied goods and promoters, and paid various fees and a commission on total sales. The Japanese company provided space for the goods.

Theoretical

This category encompasses articles which describe structural or legal aspects of the Chinese economy at a macro-level, or which speculate on the suitability of application of marketing models and methodology to the Chinese context, or which address ethical issues in marketing. One example of research that examines the structure of the Chinese economy is a paper that concluded that China, after the financial crisis of 2008, would surpass the United States in research and development, especially in commercialization of research (M. Kotler, 2010). Another paper investigating the structure of the Chinese economy and its markets is one that addresses the perennial issue of intellectual property protection (Logan & McEwan, 2010). In this paper, the authors conclude that China should seek a balance between protecting proprietary information and allowing that information to be shared. A third paper which examines the structure of the Chinese economy and its markets is one that looks at the problem of population aging in China (Hou, 2011). This paper warns that the efficiency of the Chinese labor force may be compromised by population aging, as well as compromised by the ability of the country’s pension system to take care of the nation’s elderly.

One paper addresses a marketing model and its applicability in the Chinese context. This paper takes traditional cluster marketing theory and seeks to apply it to the Chinese high-tech industry (Tu, 2011). Another paper also addresses theoretical marketing research issues. This paper argues that traditional anthropological research techniques should be applied to business in China, in order to understand cross-cultural issues in marketing, in order for foreign firms engaged in business there to obtain a competitive advantage (Tian & Borges, 2011).

A final theoretical article involves marketing ethics. This article examined the practice of “cultural tourism” in China (Walle, 2011), and concluded that the traditional marketing focus on the customer was undercutting ethnic communities in China and cheapening their traditions, or unduly creating stress for ethnic people.

DISCUSSION

The findings from this research have impelled the authors to agree with Geoffrey P. Lantos, who has stated that “The notion of a market oriented economy is still brand new in China, while marketing as a field of scholastic study is just in its beginning steps.” (2011). This article has attempted to describe the state of this infant discipline in such a way that readers may ascertain the concerns of researchers in the China marketing field, as well as the characteristics of these researchers and their institutions.

Academic journals have become the primary medium of communicating scholarly knowledge in China marketing, and the number of China marketing-related journals and articles has increased in recent years. However, compared with research covering marketing activity in Western countries, only a handful of journals have covered China marketing issues up to now. The rapid growth of marketing in the Chinese economy makes it increasingly important to gain insight into the relative influence of marketing-related research papers. This research discovers that at this time most interest so far about marketing research related to China is in consumer behavior, although there is a good deal of interest in advertising, marketing strategy, and theoretical issues. As to the structure of scholars in China marketing research, we can easily see that most authors in the field are Chinese themselves, although much research is jointly collaborative between Chinese and non-Chinese. It is obvious that there is a concentration of scholars doing China marketing in Hong Kong. It is also clear that a small majority of institutions affiliated with China marketing research is located in Europe and North America and that a large minority of such institutions is located in Asia.

It seems to the authors that several implications flow from this. One is that the content of China marketing research is very broad, but not very deep. There are many topics covered in the literature, but few of those topics have been researched thoroughly. There is a need to explore marketing issues in China more deeply. Another implication is that professional contacts between China and the West, at both the individual and institutional level, are indispensable prerequisites for doing meaningful marketing research in China. The cultural and language barriers between China and the West are certainly not small. East-West collaboration will help western scholars to dispel the mystery of Chinese markets, and will help Chinese scholars to gain access to advanced marketing research techniques developed in the West.

In the authors’ best judgment, China is still virgin territory for researchers, which should entice marketing academicians for years to come. Karl Gerth, Professor of Modern Chinese History at Oxford University, notes that total consumer spending in China of \$4 trillion in 2009 is still less than half that of the US, but it has surpassed consumer spending in Japan and is closing in on that of the EU. Gerth points out that it has taken China just a few years to learn what took these consumer countries decades: how to spend. He further points out that China’s advertising market has grown by 40% a year over the past two decades and may become the world’s largest by 2020. China now has over 2000 newspapers with a total circulation above a billion, the world’s ten largest general-circulation magazines, and over 1000 television channels. Advertising in China is now a huge industry, including over 80,000 ad companies that employ over one million people to help build brands. Gerth claims that the consequences are radically transforming China and the world. (Gerth, 2011) Such a phenomenon cries for academic investigation into China marketing by trained marketing researchers.

CONCLUSION

The emergence of China as a world-class market-driven economy presents marketing scholars with a unique opportunity. The flourishing of marketing activities in China, coupled with a relative scarcity of scholarly research into that activity, presents a wide-open door of opportunity for scholars to publish in the field. Such opportunities can be especially leveraged by collaboration between Western marketing scholars and Chinese ones.

This study was limited in several ways. In stage one, the sample of journals was restricted to those marketing journals whose titles focused on marketing in Asia or China. In addition, only articles that were posted online were examined, which may have precluded the inclusion of relevant articles on China marketing. Reasonable suggestions for further research would include an examination of *all* marketing journals, rather than Asian marketing journals, in order to find related articles. Although the authors have done this in stage two, the time period studied was only for one-half year. A study of all English-language marketing journals, over a longer time period, would be profitable.

There were certain restrictions placed on the inclusion of articles within the research sample. For example, articles concerning the behavior of ethnic Chinese consumers living outside of China or Chinese industries located outside of China were excluded. Also excluded were articles about the reaction by non-Chinese consumers to Chinese products consumed in countries other than China. Research into those areas might perhaps be worthwhile. In addition, all articles concerning marketing research into business activity in Hong Kong and Taiwan were excluded. These articles should be worthy of separate investigation. Finally, it is suggested that there is now enough China marketing research available to justify narrowing the scope of research. For example, a survey of articles related only to marketing strategy in China, or only related to advertising in China, etc., should perhaps be worthwhile.

REFERENCES

- AMA. (2010, September 25). *All Marketing Journals*, Retrieved September 11, 2011 from <http://www.marketingpower.com/Community/ARC/Pages/Research/Journals/Other/default.aspx>
- Ang, S.H. (1996). Chinese Consumers' Perception of Alpha-Numeric Brand Names. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 8, (1), 31-47.
- Atwal, G. & Williams, A. (2012). Is this Shangri-La? The Case For Authenticity In The Chinese And Indian Hospitality Industry, *Journal of Brand Management*, 19, 405–413.
- Bennet, 2008. Brand Loyalty Dynamics - China's Television Brands Come Of Age. *Australasian Marketing Journal*, 16, (2), 39-50.
- Bi, X. & Gunessee, S. (2012). Chinese Consumer Ethnocentrism: A Field Experiment. *Journal of Consumer Behaviour*, 11, (3), 252–263.
- Bodet, G. & Chanavat, N. (2010). Building Global Football Brand Equity: Lessons From The Chinese Market. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 22, (1), 55-66.

- Cai, Y. & Shannon, R. (2012). Personal Values And Mall Shopping Behaviour: The Mediating Role Of Intention Among Chinese Consumers. *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 40, (4), 290-318.
- Calantone, R. J., Benedetto, C.A., & Song, Michael. (2011). Expecting Marketing Activities and New Product Launch Execution to Be Different in the U.S. and China: An Empirical Study. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2, (1), 14-44.
- Camillo, A.A. (2012). A Strategic Investigation Of The Determinants Of Wine Consumption In China. *International Journal of Wine Business Research*, 24, (1), 68-92.
- Chang, E. & Luan, B. (2010). Chinese Consumers' Perception of Hypermarket Store Image. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 22, (4), 512-527.
- Chao, M.C.H. & Arnold, M.J. (2005). Exploring the Practical Effects of Country of Origin, Animosity, and Price-Quality. *Journal of International Marketing*, 13, (2), 114-150.
- Chaoying, T, Jian, S. & Ille. (2011). F.R. Information Handling Styles, Advertising and Brand Attitude: A Chinese Brand Case Study. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2, (1), 45-56.
- Chen, J. & Lobo, A. (2012). Organic Food Products In China: Determinants Of Consumers' Purchase Intentions. *The International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research*, 22, (3), 293-314.
- Chen, N. In press. Branding national images: The 2008 Beijing Summer Olympics, 2010 Shanghai World Expo, and 2010 Guangzhou Asian Games. *Public Relations Review*. Received 6 December 2011. Revised 30 March 2012. Accepted 1 April 2012. Available online 8 May 2012. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2012.04.003>
- Chen, Q. & Loke, Y.J. (2012). Beyond State-Owned Banks: Evidence From Shanghai Bank Customers. *Journal of Financial Services Marketing*, 17, 19-30.
- Chen, X., Chen O. & Chen N. In press. How Public Relations Functions As News Sources In China. *Public Relations Review*. Received 25 September 2011. Revised 5 April 2012. Accepted 14 April 2012. Available online 3 June 2012. <http://dx.d>
- Chen, X., Lam, L.W. & Zou, H. (2011). Antecedents and Performance Consequences of Integrated Brand Management in China: An Exploratory Study. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 24, (2), 167-180.
- Cheung, W. & Prendergast, G. (2006). Exploring the Materialism and Conformity Motivations of Chinese Pirated Product Buyers. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 18, (3), 7-31.
- Chuang, F., Morgan, R.E. & Robson, M.J. (2012). Clan Culture, Strategic Orientation And New Product Performance In Chinese Marketing Ventures: An Exploration Of Main And Moderating Effects. *Journal of Strategic Marketing*, 20, (3), 267-286.

- Cui, B. (2011). The Choice Behavior in Fresh Food Retail Market: A Case Study of Consumers in China. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2, (1), 68-76.
- Cui, G, Chan, T. & Joy, A. (2008). Consumers' Attitudes toward Marketing: A Cross-cultural Study of China and Canada. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 20, (3-4), 81-93.
- Cui, G. & Yang, X. (2009). Responses of Chinese Consumers to Sex Appeals in International Advertising: A Test of Congruency Theory. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 22, (3), 229-245.
- Custance, P., Walley, K. & Jiang, D. (2012). Crisis Brand Management In Emerging Markets: Insight From The Chinese Infant Milk Powder Scandal. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 30, (1), 18-32.
- d'Astous, A. & Li, D. (2009). Perceptions of Countries Based On Personality Traits: A Study In China, *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 21, (4), 475-488.
- Emery, C. & Tian, K. (2010). China Compared with the US: Cultural Differences and the Impacts on Advertising Appeals, *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (1) 45-59.
- Fu, G., Saunders, J. & Ou, R. (2009). Brand Extensions in Emerging Markets: Theory Development and Testing in China. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 22, (3), 217-228.
- Ga, Y., Pan, Y., Tse, D.K., & Yim, C.K.B. (2006). Market Share Performance of Foreign and Domestic Brands in China. *Journal of International Marketing*, 14, (2), 32-51.
- Gao, Z. (2007). An In-Depth Examination Of China's Advertising Regulation System. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 19, (3), 307-323.
- Gao, Z. & Zhang, H. (2011). A Comparative Study Of Chinese And US Consumers' Attitudes Toward Advertising Regulation. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 23, (1), 72-90.
- Gao, Z., Li, N., & Scorpio, Elaine A. (2012). Perception Of Puffery In Advertising: Investigating The China-US Differences, *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 24, (2), 179-198.
- Gebauer, H. & von Zedtwitz, M. (2007). Differences In Orientations Between Western European And Chinese Service Organizations. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 19, (4), 363-379.
- Gerth, K. (2010). *As China Goes, So Goes the World: How Chinese Consumers Are Transforming Everything*. New York, NY: Hill & Wang.
- Giuliano, K.K. & Droms, C.M. (2012). The Chinese Health Care System: An Analysis Of The Current And Emerging Health Care Needs. *Journal of Medical Marketing: Device, Diagnostic and Pharmaceutical Marketing*, 12, (2), 123-136.
- Hofstede, G. (1980). *Culture's Consequences: International Differences in Work-Related Value*.

Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.

Hou, L. (2011). Challenges and Opportunities: The Impacts of Population Aging on Marketing in China and the Chinese Economy. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (2), 70-80.

Hou, Z. & Zhu, Y. In press. An Institutional Perspective Of Public Relations Practices In The Chinese Cultural Contexts. *Public Relations Review*. Received 6 January 2012. Revised 23 April 2012. Accepted 10 May 2012. Available online 6 June 2012.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2012.05.002>.

Hu, J., Liu, X., Wang, S. & Yang, Z. (2012). The Role Of Brand Image Congruity In Chinese Consumers' Brand Preference. *Journal of Product & Brand Management*, 21, (1), 26–34.

Hung, K. & Heeler, R.M. (1999). Language and Its Effects on Advertising Modality: The Case of Chinese and English. *Australasian Marketing Journal*, 7, (2), 7-14.

Ishii, K. (2009). Nationalistic Sentiments of Chinese Consumers: The Effects and Determinants of Animosity and Consumer Ethnocentrism. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 21, (4), 299-308.

Jeong, S.W., Stoel, L. & Chung, Jae-Eun. (2012). Impacts Of Store Type Importance And Country Of Origin: Exploring The Case Of Dietary Supplements In The Chinese Market, *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 40, (6), 471–487.

Jiang, J., Chou, T. & Tao, X. (2011). The Impact of Price Discount, Product Complementarity and Relational Investment on Customer Loyalty: Empirical Evidence from China's Telecommunications Industry. *Asian Journal of Marketing*, 5, 1-16.

Jie, Y., Chou, T. & Chou, N. (2012). Assessing The Fit Of Two Brand Personality Scales In A Chinese Context And Revisiting The Predictive Validity Of Two Methods Of Measuring Self-Congruity. *Journal of Brand Management*, 19, 525–540.

Kirpilani, V. & Robinson, W.R. (1989). The China Market and Lessons from Successful Exporters. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 2, (4), 81-98.

Knowles, L.L., Mathur, I. & Jai-Sheng, C. (1990). Chinese Perspectives on Joint Ventures for Marketing in China. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 3, (1), 33-54.

Kotler, P. (2010). The Importance of China Marketing. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (1), 14-16.

Kwok, S., Uncles, M. & Huang, Y. (2006). Brand Preferences And Brand Choices Among Urban Chinese Consumers: An Investigation Of Country-Of-Origin Effects. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 18, (3), 163-172.

- La Ferle, C., Edwards, S.M. & Li, W.N. (2008). Culture, Attitudes, and Media Patterns in China, Taiwan, and the U.S.: Balancing Standardization and Localization Decisions. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 21, (3), 191-205.
- La Ferle, C. & Lee, W.N. (2003). Attitudes Toward Advertising - A Comparative Study of Consumers in China, Taiwan, South Korea and the United States. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 15, (2), 5-23.
- Lantos, G.P. (2011). Consumer Behavior in Action: Real-Life Managerial Applications. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2, (1), 11-13.
- Leng, X. & Zhang, M. (2011). Shanzhai as a Weak Brand in Contemporary China Marketing. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (2), 81-94.
- Li, B., Tu, H. & Li, B. (2011). Demand Attributes and Market Segmentation: An Evaluation of Refrigerator Purchase Behavior in Rural China. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (2), 13-33.
- Li, C., Cropp, F., Sims, W. & Jin, Y. In press. Perceived Professional Standards And Roles Of Public Relations In China: Through The Lens Of Chinese Public Relations Practitioners. *Public Relations Review*. Received 21 January 2012. Revised 6 April 2012. Accepted 1 May 2012. Available online 4 June 2012. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2012.05.001>
- Li, J., Mizerski, D., Lee, A. & Liu, F. (2009). The Relationship Between Attitude And Behavior: An Empirical Study In China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 21, (2), 232-242.
- Li, Q., Wang, X., & Yang, Z. (2011). The Effects of Corporate-Brand Credibility, Perceived Corporate-Brand Origin, and Self-Image Congruence on Purchase Intention: Evidence From China's Auto Industry. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 24, (1), 58-68.
- Liu, K. (2007). China, Emerging markets, Regional marketing, Retail trade, World economy. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 19, (4), 398-412.
- Liu, F., Li, J. & Cheng, H. (2006). Sex Appeal Advertising: Gender Differences In Chinese Consumers' Responses. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 18, (1), 19-28.
- Liu, M.T., Shi, G. & Wong, A. (2010). How Physical Attractiveness and Endorser-Product Match-up Guide Selection of a Female Athlete Endorser in China. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 22, (2), 169-181.
- Liu, Y. & Tang, F. (2005). An Empirical Analysis on Pricing Patterns in China's Online Book Market. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 18, (1-2), 117-136.
- Logan, R.K. & McEwan, D. (2010). The Emerging of New Business Culture: A Few Key Issues Pertain to Open Economy and Marketing. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (1), 73-84.

- Luk, S.T.K., Li, E.L.Y., Ye, W. & Xue, Y. (2003). Characteristics of Chinese Wholesalers' Marketing Behavior: A Functional Approach. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 16, (1-2), 71-95.
- MacNeal, J.U. & Mindy, F.J. (1996). Children's Influence on Chinese Families' Newfound Leisure Time and Its Marketing Implications. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 8, (3), 32-57.
- McNeil, L.S. (2012). Sales Promotion In The Supermarket Industry: A Four Country Case Comparison. *The International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research*, 22, (3), 243-260.
- Ngai, J & Cho, E. (2012). The Young Luxury Consumers in China. *Young Consumers: Insight and Ideas for Responsible Marketers*, 13, (3), np.
- Oh, L. & Zhang, Y. (2010). Understanding Chinese Users' Preference for Domestic over Foreign Internet Services. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*. 22(3), 227-243.
- Ouyang, M., Zhou, D. & Zhou, N. (2000). Twenty Years of Research on Marketing in China. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 14, (1-2), 187-201.
- Panigrahi, B., Ede, F.O. & Calcich, S. (2002). American Executives' Perceptions of The Business Climate of The Two Emerging Markets Of India And China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 14(1), 40-58.
- Parker, R.S., Haytco, D.L. & Hermans, C.M. (2011). Ethnocentrism and Its Effect on the Chinese Consumer: A Threat to Foreign Goods? *Journal of Global Marketing*, 24(1), 4-17.
- Pheng, L.S. (2000). Chinese Business Principles (770-221 B.C.): Relevance For Real Estate Marketing And Management. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 12(1), 17-36.
- Qing, P., Lobo, A. & Li, C. (2012). The Impact Of Lifestyle And Ethnocentrism On Consumers' Purchase Intentions Of Fresh Fruit In China, *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 29(1), 43-51.
- Pollay, R. W. (1983). Measuring The Cultural Values Manifest In Advertising. In J. H. Leigh and C. R. Martin, Jr., (Eds.). *Current Issues and Research in Advertising* (pp. 72-92). Ann Arbor: Graduate School of Business, Division of Research, University of Michigan.
- Prugsamatz, S. & Ofstad, L. (2006). The Influence Of Explicit And Implicit Service Promises On Chinese Students' Expectations Of Overseas Universities. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 18(2), 129-145.
- Sharma, G., Li, B. & Wang, L. (2012). Second Life and E-Marketing in an Online Social Network: The Implementation in China Marketing. *International Journal of China Marketing* 2(2), 38-59.

- Shen, Y. & Wang, X. (2011). Citizen Satisfaction with Educational Services: The Marketing Implications of Public Administration. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2(1), 77-91.
- Sin, L. Y. M. & Ho, S. (2001). An Assessment Of Theoretical And Methodological Development In Consumer Research On Greater China: 1979-1997. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 13, (1), 3-42.
- Singh, J.J., Vitell, S.J., Al-Khatib, J. & Clarke, I.C. (2007). The Role of Moral Intensity and Personal Moral Philosophies in the Ethical Decision Making of Marketers: A Cross-Cultural Comparison of China and the United States. *Journal of International Marketing*, 15, (2), 86-112.
- Skallerud, K. & Grønhaug, K. (2010). Chinese Food Retailers' Positioning Strategies And The Influence On Their Buying Behaviour. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 22, (2), 196-209.
- Smith, J.R., Liu, S., Liesch, P. & Callois, C. (2010). The Role Of Behavioral, Normative, And Control Beliefs In The Consumption Of Australian Products And Services By Chinese Consumers. *Australasian Marketing Journal*, 18, (4), 206-213.
- Stanworth, J.O (2009). Developers And Terminators In Hypermarkets' Relationships With Chinese Customers. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 21, (2), 280-293.
- Sternquist, B. & Wang, L. (2010). Buying Committees In The Chinese Retail Industry. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 22, (4), 492-511.
- Sun, J. & Wang, X. (2007). Personal Global Connectivity and Consumer Behavior. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 19, (3), 103-119.
- Sun, S. & Wang, Y. (2010). Familiarity, Beliefs, Attitudes, and Consumer Responses Toward Online Advertising in China and the United States. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 23, (2), 127-138.
- Tai, S.H.C. (2008). Relationship Between The Personal Values And Shopping Orientation Of Chinese Consumers. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 20, (4), 381-395.
- Tam, J.L.M. (2012). Linking Perceived Service Quality to Relational Outcomes in a Chinese Context. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 24, (1-2), 7-23.
- Thorellia, H.B. (1988). What Can Third World Countries Learn from China? *Journal of Global Marketing*, 1, (1-2), 69-84.
- Tian, G. (2008). *A Critique of Pan-Market*, Fort Worth, TX: Fellows Press of America.
- Tian, K.. & Borges, L. (2011). Cross-Cultural Issues in Marketing Communications: An Anthropological Perspective of International Business. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2, (1), 110-126.

Tian, R. G. & C. H. Wang (2002). China National Economies. In Pendergast, Sara, and Tom Pendergast (Eds.) *Worldmark Encyclopedia of National Economies*. 4 vols. Farmington Hills, MI: Gale Group.

Tian, R.G. & Wang, C.H. (2010). Cross-Cultural Customer Satisfaction at a Chinese Restaurant: The Implications to China Foodservice Marketing. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (1), 60-72.

Tian, Z., He, Y., Zhao, C/ & Yi, G. (2005). The Pricing Behavior of Firms In The Chinese Iron And Steel Industry. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 17, (3), 67-88.

Ting, P., Kuo, C. & Li, C. (2012). What Does Hotel Website Content Say About a Property—An Evaluation of Upscale Hotels in Taiwan and China. *Journal of Travel & Tourism Marketing*, 29, (4), 369-384.

Tsai, W. & Men, L.R. (2012). Cultural Values Reflected In Corporate Pages On Popular Social Network Sites In China And The United States, *Journal of Research in Interactive Marketing*, 6, (1), 42-58.

Tu, H. (2011). Cluster Marketing Models and Strategies: The Implications Thereof in the Chinese High-Tech Industry. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (2), 34-44.

Xue, H.B. & Wang, X.X. (2012). Face Consciousness and Decision-making Styles: An Empirical Study of Young-adult Chinese Consumers. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2, (2), 61-73.

Walle, A.H. (2011). Marketing Equitable Ethnic Cultural Tourism in China. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (2), 57-69.

Walley, K., Custance, P. & Zhang, Ruxin. (2012). Service Quality In The Language Training Market In China. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, 30, (4), 477-491.

Wang, C.L., Chen, Z.X., Chan, A.K.K. & Zheng, Z.C. (2000). The Influence of Hedonic Values on Consumer Behaviors. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 14, (1-2), 169-186.

Wang, H. (2012). Adjusting to the Local Context: A Japanese Overseas Retailer in Guangzhou, China. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 2, (2), 107-122.

Wang, X.H., Linyang, Z. & Liu, N.R. (2009). The Impacts of Brand Personality and Congruity on Purchase Intention: Evidence From the Chinese Mainland's Automobile Market. *Journal of Global Marketing*, 22, (3), 199-215.

Wang, R. & Song, J. (2011). Business Marketing in China: Review and Prospects. *Journal of Business-to-Business Marketing*, 18, (1), 1-49.

Wei, S. (1995). The New Features of Marketing Environment in The People's Republic of China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 7, (3), 20-35.

Wing, C.C.K. (1994). Distribution Reform and Retail Structure in China: An Empirical Analysis of Entries and Exits of Enterprises. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 6, (3), 3-25.

Wong, C.Y., Polonsky, M.J. & Garma, R. (2008). The Impact Of Consumer Ethnocentrism And Country Of Origin Sub-Components For High Involvement Products On Young Chinese Consumers' Product Assessments. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 20, (4), 455-478.

Wu, Z. (2009). *China in the World Economy*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Yang, H.C., Liu, H., Zhou, L. (2012). Predicting Young Chinese Consumers' Mobile Viral Attitudes, Intentions And Behavior, *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 24, (1), 59–77.

Yang, H.C. , Zhou, L. & Liu, H. (2012). Predicting Young American and Chinese Consumers' Mobile Viral Attitudes, Intentions, and Behavior. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 24, (1-2), 24-42.

Yang, C., Yang, F., Xia, Q & Ang, S. (2012). What Makes Sales in Chinese Shampoo Industry? A DEA study based on Efficient Market Hypothesis, *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 24, (4), np.

Yang, Z., Zhou, N. & Chen, J. (2005). Brand Choice of Older Chinese Consumers. *Journal of International Consumer Marketing*, 17, (4), 65-81.

Ye, L., Bose, M. & Pelton, L. (2012). Dispelling The Collective Myth Of Chinese Consumers: A New Generation Of Brand-Conscious Individualists, *Journal of Consumer Marketing*, 29, (3), 190-201.

Yi, L. & Jaffe, E.D. (2007). Economic Development And Channel Evolution In The People's Republic Of China. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 19, (1), 22-39.

Yi, Y. & Chang, T. In press. Institutionalizing Public Relations In China: A Sociological Analysis Of The Chinese Premier's Press Conference. *Public Relations Review*. Received 2 June 2011. Revised 6 December 2011. Accepted 6 December 2011. Available online 29 December 2011, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2011.12.007>.

Yu, W., & Ramanathan, R. (2012). Managing Strategic Business Relationships In Retail Operations: Evidence From China, *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics*, 24(3), 372–393.

Zhang, D. In press. A Relational Perspective On Media Relations Strategies: The Chinese Government's News Conferences From 2001 To 2009. *Public Relations Review*. Received 9

August 2011. Revised 16 January 2012. Accepted 1 March 2012. Available online 27 March 2012. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2012.03.001>.

Zhang, Z. & Han, B. (2012). The Framing Effect Of Coupon Value For New Products: An Empirical Study In China. *The International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research*, 22, (2), 209-222.

Zhang, Z.J. & Zhou, D. (2010). The Art of Price War: A Perspective from China. *International Journal of China Marketing*, 1, (1), 17-30.

Note: This is an updated article from an original paper published in *African Journal of Management* 6(17). We added a review of 93 marketing journals, covering the first half of 2012, and the fourth issue of the *International Journal of Chinese Marketing*. Thanks to the editors and reviewers of *IJCM* for their constructive suggestions to improve this article.