

Marketing Equitable Ethnic Cultural Tourism in China

**Alf H. Walle
Clark University at
Shandong University of Science and Technology**

China is one of the world's great cultural areas and, as such, many people are interested in exploring the country and experiencing its people and heritage. While many tourists focus on well known historic sites such as the Forbidden City, the Great Wall, or Mount Tai, the ethnic minorities of China are gaining increased attention and are spotlighted here. This growing interest in China's cultural diversity is spurring a growing segment of the tourism industry. While marketing efforts are inevitably customer oriented, the impacts of all stakeholders need to be taken into account. Strategies regarding how to do so are discussed with special reference to various indigenous peoples of China.

CONTEMPORARY CHINESE TOURISM AND ITS ORIGINS

The factors leading to the rapid growth of tourism in China are well known. Evolving in relative isolation, China was long distinct from the West and still is. The 19th and 20th centuries, unfortunately, were cruel to China resulting in domination by the expanding colonial powers who viewed the country as a source of markets, merchandise, and raw materials, not the home of a great civilization. Post World War II revolutionary activities gave birth to the People's Republic that was established as an alternative to the exploitation, disrespect, and humiliation that had been painfully endured for many years.

Few foreign visitors were able to visit China during the early years of the People's Republic and, as a result, the inbound tourism industry was almost nonexistent. Most citizens of China, furthermore, had little opportunity to travel outside their country and, due to this fact, Chinese demands had almost no impact upon world tourism.

After the vogue of the Cultural Revolution died down, however, Deng Xiaoping gained a significant leadership role in China and is credited with introducing the market system into his country. Among other insights, he understood that the culture and heritage of China was revered worldwide and that by encouraging tourism the cash-starved country could attract foreign currency. In the mid 1970s, Xiaoping gave his blessing to the tourism industry and since that time, its growth has been sustained and remarkable.

Today, advances in the infrastructure of China facilitate continued growth for the tourism industry. Bullet trains make travel quick, comfortable, and convenient. New airports and

improvements to existing facilities are making it easier to enter China and quickly travel within it. Fancy Westernized hotels that cater to foreign visitors are springing up as well as more modest accommodations. Tourism sites are being developed, improved, and promoted.

Approximately 35 years after Xiaoping envisioned tourism as an economic force for China, the industry has emerged as a powerful economic engine that serves many millions of visitors each year while generating generous revenues for the country.

CHINA AS A TOURISM VENUE FOR INTERNATIONAL TRAVELERS

I am lucky to have been able to reside in China for longer than a whirlwind visit. By living in the country and seeing both tourist destinations and the haunts of local people, I have gained insights that are unavailable to the average foreign traveler with only enough time for a brief visit. Although I am far from being an “old China hand”, my experiences give me more of an intuitive feeling for the country than many short term visitors are able to develop.

Spending most of my time in Jinan, Shandong Province (in the Northeast portion of China), I have found the local residents to be very friendly and accommodating. I was prepared for people who might be shocked or offended by the appearance of a white person, but I have found just the opposite. Everyone, without exception, has been very friendly and helpful. I feel safe. Although I speak no Chinese, I am able to negotiate with street peddlers who sell fruit and other items, ranging from tennis shoes to screw drivers. An “expatriate quarter” is not required to meet my needs. My only safety net is a piece of paper with my address on it. If I become lost or disoriented, I give it to a taxi driver and he takes me home. Shopping in larger stores is even easier than haggling on the street. Imported products are available at premium prices, but domestic fare of good quality is quite inexpensive compared to American or European prices. Although Western-style facilities, such as hotels, are available, I have not found them necessary and by living in a local neighborhood, I have gained more of a true “Chinese experience” than I would have otherwise enjoyed. When traveling, a variety of modestly priced hostels cater to foreign travelers.

Naturally, a certain amount of care must be taken, especially when dealing with strangers in an alien land. This, of course, is good advice to follow wherever one travels anyplace in the world. I have heard of all sorts of scams and con games such as naïve tourists being lured to a restaurant by “friendly” locals and forced to pay profoundly overcharged prices. By using common sense, however, such problems can be avoided.

My experiences indicate that China is an accessible tourism destination both for foreign travelers who prefer American/European-styled amenities and others, such as the “backpacker crowd” who are more adventurous, on the one hand, and more frugal, on the other.

In recent years, the less populated regions of Western China that are the home of various ethnic minorities have become accessible. Increasingly tourists are becoming interested in these more remote places and transforming them by their presence. As we shall see in a discussion of the Mosuo (below), the issues involved in this process are complex and expand far beyond generating the largest amount of revenue possible in the shortest amount of time.

EXAMPLES OF CULTURAL TOURISM IN CHINA

Although China is largely a culturally homogeneous country, it possesses a number of ethnic and cultural enclaves that are distinct. The situation is parallel to what exists in the North

America. Although most of the United States is somewhat similar culturally, in many sparsely populated and out of the way places (such as Appalachia, Alaska, the Dakotas, and the Four Corners region of the Southwest) rural and/or indigenous ethnic enclaves with a distinctive way of life can be found. Many of these groups have emerged as tourist attractions. Chinese ethnic groups have had a similar experience, especially in the Southwest portion of the country. By briefly discussing a number of well known examples of indigenous Chinese peoples who are showcased by tourism, an analysis of relevant issues is presented.

The Bai is an autonomous and recognized ethnic group of almost 2 million located primarily in the Yunnan Province of Southwest China. The language is related to Tibetan. The Bai people are known as creative, being respected for their sculpture, painting, and music. Their appearance is distinctive because of the habit of dressing in white. Bai religious and spiritual life combines Buddhism, local village gods, and the god of Nature.

The Bai people have a number of festivals that have attracted the attention of tourists. The most important is the March Fair that takes place each year at the foot of Mount Cangshan. Originally a purely religious activity, the event has expanded over the years to embrace secular overtones, including performances, traditional athletic competitions, and dancing. A wide variety of local merchandise is available for sale. Another event, the Torch Festival, is basically a harvest celebration; on June 25, the countryside is decorated with banners and at night the people walk their farm fields carrying torches.

In their article "Representing Identities Through Tourism: Encounters of Ethnic Minorities in Dali, Yunnan Province, People's Republic of China", Doorne, Ateljevic, I. and Bai (2003) look at the role tourism plays both in economics and identity. They argue that culture and history are assuming an increasingly important economic role. Tourism has emerged as a major factor driving the economy; the authors discuss how cultural phenomena are appropriated, manipulated, and constructed in order to attract and cater to visitors.

The Dai people of Yunnan also deserve mention. They are primarily found near the Myanmar and Laotian borders, in the southern part of Yunnan. More than 300,000 Dai live in this region. The Dai are known for their festivals, including the Water Festival held in April. Originally a religious event celebrating the cleansing power of water, the festival has expanded into a good time in which people also playfully splash others with water (including tourists) for the fun of it.

In order for the various peoples of Yunnan Province to showcase their cultural diversity, a Yunnan Nationalities Village has been constructed on the northeastern shore of Dianchi Lake in order to portray these diverse cultures and ways of life. This significant cultural endeavor demonstrates that the people of the region are well aware of both the cultural and economic value of their heritage and traditions (Sinohotelguide.com. 2000.) The village exhibits numerous households and other structures representative of specific ethnic groups so tourists can better understand the cultures they visit.

Perhaps the most interesting group is the Mosuo (Moso) of the Lugu Lake region. The Mosuo people are matrilineal (kinship and personal identity go through the mother's line of the family and not the father's.) There is no traditional form of marriage and, as a result, men reside with their mother's family instead of living full time with their mates who, in turn, live with their families. This custom has led many outsiders to imagine that most Mosuo women are promiscuous, which is not true.

Since the 1980s, tourism has become a major backbone of the Mosuo economy and, along with it, a wide number of pressures and changes have arrived including the intrusion of outsiders

and the pollution of a hitherto pristine landscape. An account of the rise of tourism among the Mosuo has recently been published by Gang (2011) that chronicles its rise from a cottage industry to a large economic endeavor that is largely planned and managed by the government. In his article, Gang acknowledges that various pressures and problems have occurred simultaneously with economic development involving tourism and outsiders.

To help the people chart their own future, the Mosuo people have established two development associations. One was founded by Cao Jianping, a governmental employee. The other, the Lugu Lake Mosuo Cultural Development Association, appears to have considerable less outside involvement, although John Lombard (an expatriate Canadian) is involved and anthropologists, such as Tami Blumfield, have interacted with the Mosuo over the years.

In my work with indigenous people, I have often seen that different members of a community often hold divergent views regarding the role of outsiders. Mirroring this tendency, Jinping's organization appears to look favorably at outside intervention, such as that provided by the government. The Lugu Lake Mosuo Cultural Development Association, in contrast, appears to be much more wary and centered around the local community. In its statement of purpose, the association emphasizes self-determinism by affirming: "All projects and priorities are determined by Mosuo leaders in the Association. Any non-Mosuo who are involved serve in an advisory/supportive position, to help the Mosuo accomplish those goals. Anyone seeking to come in and tell the Mosuo what they should do, or to run their own projects, will not be included in our work." (Lugu Lake Mosuo Cultural Development Association.)

The association is also aware that the Mosuo have an image within the world and wish to be treated with dignity and respect. As an instruction or warning to outsiders who bring their own promotional strategies to the Mosuo, the association insists that:

No promotion, marketing, or advertising for our programs will *ever* present the Mosuo as a poor, pitiful people. The Mosuo we work with are strong, determined, and proud of their culture. They have already accomplished much on their own, despite meager resources and significant obstacles. We seek to show that determination, strength, and pride to everyone else, and encourage others to work with them as partners" (Ibid.)

Attention is devoted to the fact that the Mosuo should control their own destiny, even in a changing world where outsiders and economic intervention have been thrust within their midst. Thus, the philosophy of the organization says in part:

...change is inevitable and unstoppable. It's going to happen -- in fact, it's already happening. The only real question is how that change will affect the Mosuo. In this regard, there are two main possibilities:

1) The Mosuo could simply be overwhelmed by the "outside" world, and within 50 years we may see the complete demise of their culture. This is what will almost certainly happen if the Mosuo do not have the knowledge, skills, and tools to be able to determine their own future.

2) The Mosuo will change, but still retain unique aspects of their own culture; they will integrate aspects of other cultures with their own culture. In this way, although it will change, much of the Mosuo culture will also be preserved.

Obviously, it is my belief -- and the belief of all the Mosuo working with me in all of our projects are directed toward that goal.

I can sum it all up in one word -- "CHOICE." (Ibid.)

Thus, the Mosuo have two developmental organizations to choose from. This dyad points to a commonly occurring dilemma that indigenous people often face. To what extent can the people control their own destiny and to what extent is the aid of outside specialists necessary and preferable?

THE IMPACTS OF TOURISM

Tourism is routinely lauded as a means of generating business activity in a country or region that needs an economic stimulus. It can often be successful in rustic places as well as providing employment for “unskilled” workers. Pursuing this industry, however, inevitably involves costs (often hidden, unanticipated, and slow to develop) that ought to be acknowledged, weighed, and mitigated as decisions are made and strategies developed. For discussions of the tradeoffs and implications of cultural tourism see (Walle 2010, Rojas and Turner 2011, Mortensen and Nicholas 2010, and Killick (2008.)

Observers of Chinese tourism have long recognized the implications of the industry and its impacts. In 1987, for example, Alan Lew, published “The History, Policies, and Social Impact of International Tourism in the People’s Republic of China.” As the title indicates, Lew was appropriately concerned with the social context of tourism and the impacts it exerts.

Mirroring Lew’s concerns, this paper discusses the varied influences of marketing upon tourism and the hosts who provide tourism services. In specific, cultural tourism often exerts disruptive forces that potentially undercut the local population in hurtful ways. This type of issue has long been analyzed and lamented. Tourism strategies, furthermore, may trigger social changes that have negative implications. As a result, efforts to empower local communities that are becoming involved with tourism often need to be pursued.

In order to explore these issues, models developed by *The Equitable Cultural Tourism Handbook* (Walle 2010) are discussed with reference to China.

MARKETING TO CONSUMERS AND ITS IMPACT

Marketing, of course, involves responding to the needs of a particular target market in strategic ways. Modern marketing is anchored by the “marketing concept” that suggests that the only reason for an organization to exist is to serve its customers.

Ever since it was introduced by E. Jerome McCarthy in the early 1960s, the “4 Ps model of marketing” (that focuses upon 4 controllable variables dubbed “Product”, “Place” “Promotion”, and “Price”) has dominated the field. Some tourism/hospitality marketing texts (such as Robert Morrison’s *Hospitality and Travel Marketing*) expand the number of “Ps” to reflect the uniqueness of the industry; even here, however, the basic approach of the 4 Ps paradigm is preserved: marketing is depicted as (1) developing an understanding of customer demands and (2) manipulating the available controllable variables of marketing to most effectively serve it. In order to demonstrate how this paradigm can be related to cultural tourism, each P will be briefly discussed.

Product

The term “product” refers to what the customer receives (and, typically, what is designed and marketed with the needs, wants, and expectations of the customer in mind. Often, relatively little attention to the impact upon those who provide goods and services.

Tourism strategies, however, need to avoid undercutting the community, cheapening its traditions, or unduly creating stress for the people. Dealing with such details, unfortunately, often falls outside of the range of marketing thought. Under such circumstances, problems can arise if inappropriate demands upon the host culture are made or if impacts are not anticipated and mitigated. In the case of the Mosuo, for example, large hotels and various tourism influences are impacting the culture. While this may be inevitable, the people want a choice. Care needs to be taken so the community is not weakened or undermined in the process of encouraging economic activity.

In short, tourism marketers often feel comfortable adjusting what is offered to respond to customers demands. While doing so is reasonable, efforts should be made to insure that these strategic manipulations are appropriate and respectful to the host community.

Price

Deciding what price to charge can be a difficult issue to negotiate and evaluate. As a result of strategic imbalances, host communities may not be treated in an equitable manner. When a host culture positively contributes to the tourism industry, however, its members deserve to earn an equitable return for their efforts. Not only is such an arrangement ethical, it can help insure the long-term success of the tourism venture. People who do not receive adequate and fair compensation, for example, can easily become demoralized and the quality of the goods and services they provide can decline as a result. Such responses can hurt both the host community and its business partners.

The pricing structure can also be used to control demand. If, for example, a community can comfortably handle only a certain number of guests, the price can be manipulated in order to keep the traffic to a desired level.

Price, of course, often needs to be adjusted in order to mesh with the product itself. When buying a premium excursion to a Chinese tourism destination, of course, patrons expect to be treated accordingly while those taking a cheap whirlwind tour do not demand or anticipate the same level of quality.

Place

The place variable (where cultural tourism activities and experiences actually occur) can have a profound impact on the hosts of cultural tourists. Traditional musicians, storytellers, and other performers who are not accustomed to a large audience may feel uncomfortable being showcased before a big crowd. Efforts need to be taken to minimize the potential for such hurtful experiences and environments. As discussed above, the Bia people have festivals, originally religious in nature, that are becoming important tourism attractions. What are the implications (positive and negative) of this transition? Strategically controlling venues where hosts and tourists interact can be important.

In considering place/distribution issues, decisions should not merely be based upon generating the highest short-term profit. What are the likely side effects of various distribution methods? Should the nature of the merchandise and the speed with which it is produced be considered? These are issues that the mainstream business community might overlook, but they can have a significant impact upon the host community and the ultimate quality of the tourism products and services being marketed.

Promotion

Promotion refers to any way in which an organization communicates with its target market (as well as its partners or facilitators) in order to encourage patronage. On many occasions, promotional strategies that make sense from a customer perspective appear as hurtful when the host community is considered. Above we saw that the Mosuo specifically stated that “No promotion, marketing, or advertising for our programs will *ever* present the Mosuo as a poor, pitiful people.” Nevertheless this kind of inappropriate promotion is obviously a threat; otherwise this possibility would not have been mentioned.

Summarizing this brief overview of marketing, the profession typically views its mission as (1) choosing a target market/markets and (2) catering to its/their demands. Doing so is pursued by manipulating the controllable variables that are available in order to more effectively respond to the market’s wishes and expectations. This process is typically called “marketing management.”

Graphically, this arrangement can be portrayed as:

TABLE 1
MARKETING MANAGEMENT: AN OVERVIEW

Variable	Universe Of Discourse	Impacts	Strategic Implications
Product	The actual good or service being sold to the target market	People seek the tangible and intangible characteristics of the Product. To be successfully marketed, the product must satisfy a need.	The good or service can respond to consumer expectations and/or respond to consumer feelings, such as curiosity.
Price	The price which the organization charges for its goods and services	The price can influence the size of the market and when people will buy the product.	Price is two things (1) a reward for a job well done and (2) a strategic variable.
Place	The distribution network and where the product will be made available	Where the product is and who sells it may influence the level of sales and who buys it.	Appropriately getting the product to where it can be purchased.
Promotion	Communication between the organization, its customers, intermediaries, and other relevant publics that facilitate marketing.	In order to most effectively sell a product, the organization must communicate effectively to appropriate audiences.	Various publics need to be addressed. Communication should reinforce and build upon the other marketing variables.
Marketing Management	Coordinating all of the controllable variables so that the benefits of synergism make the organization and its Products more marketable.	By consciously interlacing the various controllable variables, the organization can more efficiently and effectively market the product.	By overtly combining all the controllable variables in a coherent and synergistic manner, marketing is more effective.

Marketing, therefore, can be viewed as a strategic science that (1) focuses upon the needs of specific groups of customers and (2) adjusts the organization’s controllable variables in order to satisfy the desires and demands of that target market. Currently the most dominant paradigm of the field is the 4 Ps model in which consumer demands are satisfied by manipulating the 4 controllable variables of product, price, place, and promotion.

Certainly, marketing is an ethical and moral activity because helping people achieve their goals and satisfy their needs is a good thing. Nevertheless, mainstream marketing is often so focused on serving customers that the needs of other stakeholders are not adequately perceived and/or adequately addressed.

MACROMARKETING: A BROADER VIEW

The type of activity discussed above can be viewed as “micromarketing” (analogous to microeconomics) because it focuses solely upon the benefits that a firm and a target market receive through interacting with one another. Other important considerations that fall outside this universe of discourse tend to be unrecognized or discounted.

Macromarketing, a subdiscipline of the field, however, is concerned with issues that expand beyond the dyad of a firm and its target market. Macromarketing deals with all significant impacts, especially those that are unanticipated and impinge upon stakeholders who are not a part of the patron-client relationship. This kind of analysis can be extremely relevant in situations involving cultural tourism and, as a result, it will be briefly discussed.

Macromarketing focuses upon the full implications of market driven activities. It provides a valuable alternative to micro analysis that might not take the wellbeing of all impacted stakeholders into account. Cultural tourism strategies, for example, can exert a profound impact upon host communities, fragile cultural enclaves, and even entire regions. Macromarketing can help decision makers and their communities to better understand the full implications of their decisions.

Building upon this analytic model, macromarketing is concerned with equitably evaluating the needs of the community while simultaneously enhancing the quality of life that people enjoy. It goes without saying that many host communities that are considering an involvement with cultural tourism can benefit from this kind of analysis.

Charles Slater was a pioneer who affirmed that marketing and its impacts cannot be legitimately viewed in isolation. He, for example observed: “marketing is a part of the whole social process system rather than only a function within each firm or institution” (Slater & Jenkins 1979:374).

From the beginning, macromarketing has employed some form of systems theory analysis; Slater noted, for example, that: “the common thread [of macromarketing papers] was the systems concept of putting marketing in the context of both the firm and society” (Slater 1977:1.)

The systems theory approach in marketing goes back at least to the late 1950s/early 1960s when marketing pioneer Wroe Alderson began modeling the marketing system and its impacts in a holistic manner. Alderson was influenced by the general systems theory model provided by his friend Kenneth Boulding (1956) who envisioned an array of increasingly complex paradigms that can be used to model behavior in terms of interrelationships between the various parts of a system.

These approaches view the elements of culture/society (including marketing relationships) in terms of how they fit into the greater social structure, contribute to it, and, perhaps, function as agents of change. Such a systems analysis is also able to usefully deal with how marketing impacts people who are not involved in a marketing relationship. In many cases, a significant segment of the population receives no benefits, but is hurt by marketing strategies. This reality raises ethical considerations that transcend a customer orientation. Host cultures, their members,

traditions, habitats, etc. might be undercut because of cultural tourism; this possibility needs to be considered, avoided, and where necessary mitigated.

As macromarketing grew, it built upon Alderson's systems theory approach in order to model the full impact of marketing strategies. By 1982, the new field of macromarketing was consciously able to define itself. Thus, in the "Editor's working definition of macromarketing", George Fisk (1982:3) states that macromarketing deals with:

1. Impacts and consequences of society on marketing and actions (marketing externalities),
2. The impact and consequences of society on marketing systems and actions (social sanctions), and
3. The understanding of marketing systems in their aggregate dimensions (macro-systems analysis).

The term "marketing externalities" refers to everything outside of the buyer/seller relationship that is involved with and/or impacted by the organization and its customers. Macromarketing specifically recognizes that external groups are often affected by the processes of marketing and consumption. As a result, the broader implications of these relationships need to be addressed.

Increasingly this view is recognized as important. Thus, Syring (2009) observes in a recent article "In such circumstances...others must absorb the cost of doing business even though they receive no compensation for the price they are unwilling to pay"

If a tourism destination quickly emerges as very popular, for example, it might become overwhelmed, leading to stress and unhappiness. The impact of cultural tourism, furthermore, may undermine the community or prevent people from pursuing other vocations and ways of life. The focus upon tourists might cause artistic traditions to wither. A well developed subsistence way of life might be abandoned. If tourism is abruptly terminated for some reason, these people may have lost their traditional means of earning a livelihood. These concerns are often major issues that host communities need to address.

In such circumstances, the organization, its customers, and a segment of the local population might benefit from cultural tourism while others must absorb the costs of doing business even though they receive no compensation for the price they unwillingly pay. (The classic argument used to rebut such complaints, of course, is that tourism brings jobs and economic activity to the entire community and, therefore, everybody benefits, directly or indirectly, as the fruits of economic activities "trickle down" to the community as a whole). In spite of attempts to argue away this sticky problem, cultural tourism might extract costs that are unfairly paid by those who receive no or few benefits. The sacrifices of these people need to be recognized when cultural tourism strategies are formulated. The systems theory orientation of macromarketing can address such issues in ways that help analyze the true costs of cultural tourism upon the host community as well as determining mitigation strategies.

A relevant issue that host communities often need to consider involves how to structure cultural tourism in ways that lead to responsible marketing and consumption. Doing so involves a far-reaching understanding of the full implications of cultural tourism within a specific community. Especial attention needs to be devoted to envisioning inadvertent and unintended consequences of marketing and consumption that might not be obvious at first glance.

A classic article that deals with these issues is George Fisk’s “Criteria for a Theory of Responsible Consumption” (1973). Fisk concentrates upon the fact that technological change encourages certain marketing decisions that, while serving the overt demands of customers, may not be in the best interest of society because of negative long term implications. As a result, Fisk questions the wisdom (and perhaps even the legitimacy) of marketing strategies that fail to recognize and deal with their potential negative legacy. A key issue to remember is that people who are not involved in the buying/selling/consumption process may be unwillingly forced to bear costs associated with these economic activities while receiving no benefits. Cultural tourism potentially creates situations where these potentials may materialize.

In addition, macromarketing has long been interested in the impacts of tourism (Belk and Costa 1999, Jamison 1999, Nguyen 2009.) Since much cultural tourism takes place in rural and developing regions, macromarketing is especially well equipped to serve the industry.

The perspectives of macromarketing usefully transcend the micro-oriented buyer/seller orientation in ways that consider the well-being of all impacted stakeholders. The systems theory model provides a means of addressing the wide range of impacts that marketing and consumption may exert upon the host community. An overview of the macromarketing paradigm is provided in the following table:

TABLE 2
THE MACRO MODEL: AN OVERVIEW

Issue	<i>Universe of discourse</i>	<i>Ethical Focus</i>	<i>Multiple stakeholders</i>
Externalities	Impacts that extend beyond customers and those who serve them	Ethical behavior needs to consider a wide range of impacts besides benefits to customer and organizations that serve them.	The concept of externalities facilitates an ability to deal with various groups besides customers.
Impacts	Marketing has multiple impacts. Unintentional and unanticipated consequences may impact people who are not part of the patron/client relationship.	The marketing process exerts many impacts. Assessing these impacts and, where necessary mitigating them, is an ethical way to do business.	The impact of micromarketing and marketing management upon external groups is a specific area that needs to be addressed.
Systems Theory	Systems theory, which deals with the relationships between various parts of a larger whole, is a useful perspective of macromarketing.	Macromarketing models are often based upon systems theory. They are particularly useful in developing an appropriate ethical focus involving multiple stakeholders.	Systems theory focuses on interconnectedness. The method is useful when dealing with the needs and vulnerabilities of various external stakeholders.

Macromarketers portray their field as a much needed alternative to “4 Ps” marketing management that is based upon the marketing concept and views the patron/client relationship in isolation. These macromarketing perspectives parallel the ideas of tourism theorists such as J.

Michael Haywood (1990) who seeks to transcend the marketing concept when assessing tourism strategies. Macromarketing also dovetails with the perspectives of host communities that are concerned about possible negative side effects of cultural tourism and economic development.) Host communities are aware that cultural tourism strategies have often triggered unanticipated and unintended side effects that were not initially obvious. The tools of macromarketing can be used to avoid blindly making decisions without an adequate understanding of their consequences. Graphically portrayed, these differences emerge as:

TABLE 3
MICROMARKETING AND MACROMARKETING COMPARED

Issue	Micromarketing	Macromarketing
Focus	The micro patron/client relationship between an organization and its customers.	The broader implications of marketing including, but not limited to the patron/client relationship
Unique perspective	Organizations exist to serve clients. The entire organization should revolve around clients.	Marketing exists within the larger environment and exerts a variety of influences upon it. Marketers should consider these relationships and their implications.
Breadth of field	Choosing a lucrative target market and then strategically manipulating the product to please it.	A broad systems theory analysis, in addition to marketing management needs to be employed.
Significance	Since tourism organizations and host communities need the support of a target market, catering to it in strategic ways is important.	Host communities have specific needs. A macromarketing perspective is best able to factor such variables into strategic planning.
Relevance	Micromarketing/marketing management emphasizes the needs of those who are involved in the buying/selling relationship.	Macromarketing considers the needs of a wide array of stakeholders, not merely customers and businesses that serve them.

Both micromarketing and macromarketing are legitimate and needed. Neither orientation should overshadow the other. Unfortunately, in innumerable economic development projects (including many involving cultural tourism) the micromarketing orientation dominates. This discussion urges host communities to temper micro assessments with a macromarketing analysis that deals with the broader implications of a proposed or existing cultural tourism venture.

Looking at the examples of cultural tourism impacting ethnic minorities of China, the value of a macro approach to strategic planning and assessment can be a vital tool. Macromarketers tend to argue that quality of life issues and strategies of empowering local communities need to be given a high priority. By doing so, marketing can best achieve its goal of fostering equity and parity and not merely serving external organizations by pleasing customers.

DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION

Starting from humble beginnings in the 1970s, cultural tourism in China has grown to be a powerful force and one that governmental agencies and private organizations use to stimulate economic activity. As a result, in China (as elsewhere) encouraging and planning cultural tourism is an important consideration.

Historically, much of this activity was conducted using what can be called “micromarketing” perspectives. This paradigm focuses primarily (if not exclusively) upon the benefits that accrue to an organization and its customers when they interact with one another. A blind spot in this method, unfortunately, is that the needs, desires, and vulnerabilities of those who provide cultural tourism goods and services can easily be overlooked.

An alternative to such “micro” perspectives is provided by macromarketing, a subdiscipline that is dedicated to examining the full impacts of marketing activities and proposing alternatives that are equitable and viable. Increasingly, macromarketing perspectives are employed when marketing strategies are envisioned. Such techniques have a vital role to play when cultural tourism strategies are developed and implemented. By embracing such a method of analysis, local people can be empowered and their quality of life enhanced.

China is home to a wide range of indigenous peoples and many of them have become (or are emerging as) tourist attractions. Some, such as the Mosou, have developed sophisticated cultural development associations that work to insure that tourism policies and strategies are not dictated solely from above, that they are equitable, and that they reflect the desires of the people.

I applaud such efforts, as a good business practice as well as an ethical path that can lead to parity for all impacted stakeholders.

REFERENCES

Belk Russell, and Janeen Costa (1995) “International Tourism: An Assessment and Overview” Journal of Macromarketing V 15 2 33-49.

Boulding, Kenneth (1956) “General Systems Theory: The Skelton of Science” Management Science Vol. 2: 197-208.

Doorne, S., Ateljevic, I. and Bai, Z. (2003), “Representing identities through tourism: encounters of ethnic minorities in Dali, Yunnan Province, People's Republic of China”. International Journal of Tourism Research, 5: 1–11.

Fisk, George (1973) “Criteria for a Theory of Responsible Consumption” Journal of Marketing. 37(April): 24-31.

Fisk, George (1982) “Editor’s working definition of macromarketing” Journal Of Macromarketing (Spring 1982): 3-4.

Gang, Chen (2011) “Sustainable Development of Eco-Cultural Tourism in Remote Regions: Lessons Learned from Southwest China” International Journal of Business Anthropology Vol. 2 (1.): 121-35.

Haywood, K. Michael (1990) “Revising and implementing the marketing concept as it applies to tourism”. Tourism Management (1990): 195-205.

Jamison, David J (1999) “Masks Without Meanings: Notes on the Processes, Consumption, and Exchange in the context of First World-Third World Tourism” Journal of Macromarketing V 19 June 8-19.

Killick, E (2008) "Creating Community: Land Titling, Education, and Settlement Formation Among the Asheninka of Peruvian Amazonia" The Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Anthropology V. 13 22-47.

Luga Lake Mosou Cultural Development Association. Retrieved in March 2011 from <http://mosuoproject.org/>

Lee, Dong-Jin and M. Joseph Sirgy, Val Larsen, and Newell D. Wright (2002) "Developing a Subjective Measure of Consumer Well Being" Journal of Macromarketing 22 (2): 158-69.

Lew, Alan A. 1987. "The History, Policies and Social Impact of International Tourism in the People's Republic of China." Asian Profile Vol. 15(2) April:117-28.

Morrison, Allistar (1989) Tourism and Hospitality Marketing. Albany, New York: Delmar.

Mortensen, L and Nicholas, G (2010) "Riding the Tourism Train?: Navigating Intellectual Property Heritage and Community Based Approaches to Cultural Tourism" Anthropology News V 51 11-2.

Nguyen, Tho D, (2009) "Place Development: Attributes and Business Customer Satisfaction in Tien Giabg Province Vietnam" Journal of Macromarketing V 29 December 384-91.

Rojas, D S. and Turner, E. (2011) "Spam and Pop Tarts? Joint Response to Anthropology and Tourism" Anthropology News V 52b # 4.

Sinohotelguide.com. (2000) Attraction and sightseeing in kunming: Yunan Nationalities Villages Accessed in March 2011 from <http://www.sinohotelguide.com/kunming/tour/sight/nantion.html>

Slater, Charles C. (1979) Macro-Marketing Distributive Processes From a Societal Perspective Boulder Colorado: Graduate School of Business Administration.

Slater, Charles C. & Jenkins, Dorothy (1979) Systems Approach To Comparative Macromarketing" in Macro-Marketing: New Steps In The Learning Curve. George Fisk & Robert Nason editors. Boulder Colorado: Graduate School of Business.

Syring, D (2009) "La Vida Matizada: Time Sense, Everyday Rhythms, and Globalized Ideas of Work" Anthropology and Humanism V 34 119-34.

Travel China Guide (2011) "Bai Nationality" Accessed in March 2011, <http://www.travelchinaguide.com/intro/nationality/bai/>

Walle, Alf H. (2010) The Equitable Cultural Tourism Handbook . Charlotte, North Carolina USA: Information Age Publications.

Zhou Ling-qiang and Huang Zhu-hui (2004) "Sustainable Development of Rural Tourism in China: Challenges and Policies" Economic Geography 2004 (issue 4):4.